

Baruch Faculty  
Senate Plenary  
October 7th, 2021  
Minutes

A total of 90 members of the faculty senate, general faculty, staff, and students logged into the Zoom meeting.

Professor Terry Martell, Chair, Baruch College Faculty Senate, convenes the meeting at 12:30 p.m via Zoom.

**I. Approval of the Agenda:** The agenda is approved by assent without additions

**II. Approval of the Minutes:** The minutes of the September 2, 2021 meeting is approved by assent and without additions

**III. BFS Reports**

a. **Report from the Chair, Professor Martell**

A personal priority of the BFS Chair is the issue of a fairer allocation of student tuition and fee revenue as a present of the total cost of running Baruch College. 70+% of the operating budget at Baruch is paid by tuition. We get the smallest allocation of State Aid as percent of TOC than any other senior colleges. We are the best in CUNY in spite of the fact that we have the least (relatively) financial support.

Professor Martell is meeting with Alison Lee, the President of the SGA, and members of her Executive Committee to see if we can jointly develop a plan to move what Professor Martell hopes will be a joint resolution between BFS and SGA going forward.

Since the last BFS meeting there have been two Cabinet meetings. The primary topic of discussion in addition to a review of current developments is the six goals that the president is challenging the Cabinet to operationalize. This process will consume much of the fall semester. As these plans evolve, Professor Martell hopes to be able to share them with the BFS. Professor Martell also hopes to align our BFS committees with these goals, particularly those addressing DEI, Instructional Modality, Incentive Based Budget and Faculty and Staff Innovation.

The BFS Executive Committee this week met separately with Provost Essig and then President Wu. Both meetings provided an opportunity for the BFS Executive Committee to exchange ideas and seek clarification on various issues. The meetings to be open, cordial, frank and useful. We all agreed that more meetings like these will take place during the semester. I will ask Rick Wilkins, our secretary, to summarize the issues discussed.

b. **Report from Richard Wilkins, Faculty Senate Secretary**

Our first meeting with Provost Essig included the following discussion items: Student Vaccination Policy, Travel policy, Definitions of Hybrid and Online Teaching Modalities, Commitment to support faculty research, and some other miscellaneous items.

*Student vaccination policy:*

The point was made that there is no desire whatsoever for any one single student to be withdrawn from the college. Currently we are serving some 39,000 seats in classes. Over 95% of those seats are filled with vaccinated students, 2% have valid exemptions from the vaccine mandate which leaves 3% who have not complied with the mandate. It was agreed that members drawn from the respective senate subcommittees should monitor and ensure that those students being withdrawn from classes should receive assistance and guidance on how best to continue with their studies. Emailed discussions prior to the meeting revolved around the validity of the mandate itself with one of the executive committee members expressing reservations about the science informing the policy and whether or not it is responsible to be withdrawing students from their classes. The Provost reported that senior college provosts were united in saying that students should be vaccinated before registering for a class in the spring. However, CUNY Central decided that students would be dropped from classes at the start of the semester (Jan 27<sup>th</sup>) if they were unable to show they had been vaccinated and complied with the mandate.

It was reaffirmed that the mistakes of the summer over the varied and confusing messaging to both students and faculty would not occur. The vaccine mandate is a firm one.

*Travel policy:*

Restrictions for travel are in place, but upon application waivers are being approved for essential travel

*Definitions of Hybrid and Online Teaching Modalities:*

The advisory council is working on definitions of the varied teaching modalities within the context of the Baruch College. These definitions will take into account the array of programs being offered at Baruch as well as departmental priorities about what works best for the delivery of those programs. The interest here is to increase the baseline with respect to a positive learning experience for all who attend the college. The provost made a point of countering the argument that a need for an increased capacity is driven by the need for additional tuition dollars. The provost suggested that we reframe this argument and acknowledge that growth is needed because we have more students qualified to access a Baruch College education. We need to service that need. The demand is most acute at the graduate level.

*Commitment to support faculty research*

It was noted that the term “innovation” carries meanings associated with faculty research and teaching. The executive committee requested that the provost be more explicit in her messaging about her office’s support of advancing faculty research in terms of both its funding as well as its promotion.

*Miscellanea:*

Other discussion items included the CUNY Central “credit for prior learning initiative” and the historical precedent of *pathways* as wholesale disenfranchisement of faculty and their ability to determine curricula changes at the college; and the *Faculty Fellows Program* and its use as a scaffold in structuring partnerships and collaborative learning experiences across faculty, their departments, and their students.

Our conversation with President WU revolved largely around the six College Goals currently being shaped into action items:

- **Goal 1:** Launch multifaceted institutional transformation to elevate and enhance diversity, equity, and inclusion

- **Goal 2:** Complete institutional structure and planning toward an integrated model for student success: increase student engagement, academic momentum, degree completion, and post-graduation success
- **Goal 3:** Promote faculty and staff innovation to fully leverage Baruch’s intellectual horsepower and capacity as a learning organization
- **Goal 4:** Migrate from virtual instruction to a mixture of in-person, hybrid, and HyFlex, as well as synchronous and asynchronous online courses, all while facilitating and maximizing experiential learning
- **Goal 5:** Initiate multiyear effort toward an incentive-based budget model: align institutional priorities and resource allocation; create incentive for collaboration and entrepreneurial program innovation
- **Goal 6:** Expand visibility and philanthropy while strengthening and building external partnerships

It should be noted that each of the six goals were discussed within the larger context of (1) pre-pandemic *Baruch College Strategic Plan*, (2) the emergence of the pandemic and the switch to an online modality, and (3) a post-pandemic context in which the landscape of public education at CUNY has demonstrably changed. Regarding the respective college goals the following were discussed:

*The incentive-based budget (IBB) model (Goal 5)*

Drawn from the *Responsibility Centered Management (RCM)* model developed at the University of Pennsylvania the college budget is treated as a resource and allocated based on composite calculations of, for example, the enrollment that is generated by each one of the schools and indexed as revenue brought into the college. Compared and contrasted to the present *Central Allocation Model* where CUNY central determines what monies we receive—and as has been stated already we receive a wholly inequitable share of an increasingly disproportionate pie—the IBB model provides for a “rising tide” of financial resources. Incentivizing growth through partnerships and collaborations across the college will reap its just financial rewards. It should be noted that 85% of our budget is a *people budget*. The IBB model is poised to be an invaluable resource within which we, as the people that populate the college, can use to advance innovation in our teaching and research activities.

*Research and Scholarship (Goal 3)*

We also discussed the lack of specific mention of research and scholarship in the six goals and the significance of messaging from the administration that research and scholarship are important and a central part of our identity and role as a College.

*Diversity, equity, and inclusion (Goal 1)*

The faculty and staff that populate the college should reflect the diverse student body that attends the college.

*Instructional modalities (Goal 4)*

As a post-pandemic initiative, the college will migrate from virtual instruction to a mixture of in-person, hybrid, and HyFlex instruction. This will include synchronous and asynchronous online courses, with all modalities facilitating and maximizing experiential learning

*Philanthropy (Goal 6)*

While we maintain a strong reputation in the city and attract external funding from these local sources we are challenged to reach beyond the context of the city and explore new forms of philanthropy elsewhere.

### *Questions and Answers*

Professor Jennifer Mangels asks whether or not the budget is simply a zero-sum game: when others get more, others undoubtedly will get less. Professor Martell agrees. Fielding a question from Professor Warren Gordon about how to reconcile our underfunding with the fact that we outperform many of the other colleges on almost every metric, Professor Martell notes that we must protect the best or risk losing it all. It is both a philosophical as well as an equity argument.

Professor Glenn Peterson references a recent article to appear in the journal *Inside Higher Education*. It refers to new edition of *Robert's Rules* which includes a historical/contextual essay. In an interview with the editions editor the author notes the following:

“There are times when structured deliberation of the sort that *Robert's Rules* provides is not just helpful but, I would argue, necessary. Governing boards, faculty senates, department meetings, student government, clubs and organizations, for example, operate best when basic deliberative procedures are followed. I understand that some people find *Robert's Rules* fussy and overly formalistic. But that's only true when the rules are clumsily or sporadically deployed. A seasoned parliamentarian can stimulate participation and improve decision making in deliberative assemblies by ensuring that everyone is heard. If you don't believe me, take a deep breath, close your eyes and think about the last faculty meeting you attended. Enough said.”

[Author discusses his book on 'Robert's Rules of Order' \(insidehighered.com\)](http://insidehighered.com)

Professor Peterson argues that our senate plenary meetings might benefit from an infusion of fresh air and advocates for using *Roberts Rules* and a skillful parliamentarian to stimulate deliberative discourse on the senate floor.

Professor Martell introduces the following initial reports from the BFS Standing Committees and asks that the senate approve the nominees for the Standing Committees. Once they are officially organized, they will begin their work. There has already been discussions among the Chairs as to the key issues to address.

### **c. Standing Committees of the BFS**

#### **Planning and Finance**

##### **Co-Chairs Professors Bellamy and Johnson**

Katharine Cobb (VP Finance-ex-officio, non-voting)

Carla Bellamy (WSAS; Sociology/Anthropology)

Kevin Frank (WSAS; English)

Sam Johnson (WSAS; Psychology)

Richard Wilkins (WSAS; Communications)

Chandrika Kulatilleke (WSAS; Natural Sciences)

Linda Rath (Library)

Christina Christoforatu (Eng)

Elliott Axelrod (ZSB; Law)

Andreas Grein (Mkt/IntBus)

Allison Lehr Samuels (ZSB; Management/Center for Teaching and Learning)

Marios Koufaris (ZSB; Information Systems and Statistics)

This committee's function is to participate in (1) Deliberations leading to the preparation of the budget submitted by the President to the Chancellor; (2) Discussions before the allocation of the College budget once it has been received; and (3) Deliberations of any other tasks assumed by the Vice President for Administration and associated with obtaining or utilizing resources for College purposes.

The committee is approved by assent.

### **Academic Freedom and Responsibility**

#### **Chair Professor Frank**

Abdulla Tansel (IS/S, Zicklin)

Andreas Grein (Mkt/Int'l Bus, Zicklin)

Don Waisanen (SPIA)

Elizabeth Minei (Comm, Weissman)

Eric Gander (Comm, Weissman)

Helene Eisenman Barbour (NatSci, Weissman)

Professor Frank offers the following statement for the record:

"I would like to remind you all that the committee's central purpose is "To protect and assure the rights of members of the academic community to freely study, discuss, investigate, teach, research, publish or administer, as appropriate to their respective roles and responsibilities. If you have a complaint regarding infringements upon these rights, please go to the Baruch Faculty Senate website, download the *Academic Freedom Complaint Form*, fill it out in as much detail as possible, and email it to [academic.freedom@baruch.cuny.edu](mailto:academic.freedom@baruch.cuny.edu). Complaints are managed guided by the value of confidence.

Historically, the Committee has acted only when there were specific complaints, and such requests for action remain our priority. However, in the absence of such requests, the committee may examine existing or potential threats to academic freedom and responsibility posed by CUNY and Baruch programs and policies.

(III) Quite related to the last point, the Academic Freedom and Responsibility Committee has been asked to monitor what happens to the students dropped from in-person courses because they are not vaccinated to ensure, to the maximum extent possible, that their academic progress is not adversely affected. I will begin this process by reaching out to the provost's office to liaison with the person coordinating this effort.

(IV) This policy dropping unvaccinated students from taking courses in-person leads naturally to a few comments and questions, so I will turn to these before coming to my last topic.

(a) Here, it is important that we remind ourselves periodically of the charge of the Baruch Faculty Senate. So, from our by-laws I quote: "The Baruch College Faculty Senate (hereafter referred to as 'the Senate') represents the General Faculty in areas of faculty responsibility, interest, and concern. Its purposes are to (i) formulate and recommend policies to the Administration and other bodies of the College with regard to relevant aspects of college-wide planning and operation; (ii) review and comment on policies contemplated or initiated by the Administration and other bodies of the College, and (iii) to provide a channel of communication among the faculty, student organizations and the

administrative officers of the College.” This indicates clearly the senate is not just here to review or “monitor” policies. It is to be involved in the formulation and recommendation of policies.

(b) I believe it was sometime last week that we received a message from the provost’s office titled “Supporting Our Students” which, among other things, declared,

“Our approach is guided by the following principles as directed by the CUNY Central Office for system-wide implementation:

- Equitably supporting all of our students in their pursuit of degrees is also a top priority;
- We embrace the best science available to guide decisions, and it has unquestionably demonstrated that vaccination against Covid-19 is essential and the most important tool we have;
- It is necessary to have a vaccinated student body in order to function fully as a university/college now and beyond this pandemic.”

1. Was the Baruch Faculty Senate involved in the Baruch “approach”? That is, is having the senate chair in cabinet meetings and merely reporting on an administrative decision a good model of faculty representation in policy formulation and recommendation?

2. Is it really necessary to have a vaccinated student body in order to function fully now and beyond this pandemic? Is CUNY Central really embracing the best science available? How do we know?

3. “Equitably” is a reminder that “E” in DEI concerns another principle: justice and fairness. If the mandate is only for students (it is not yet for faculty and staff, who apparently have the PSC to fight against a mandate for them), is this not a case of faculty and staff rights to “safety” at the expense of students? Is that fair and just?

(V) Speaking of DEI, my final topic concerns Zicklin’s long-standing, well-intended efforts to attract and to hire diverse candidates. My understanding is that these efforts continue to be made with offers at median salary pay scales. Given New York City cost of living and what the competition in and around NYC can offer these candidates (not only in salary, but housing), is offering median salaries an effective strategy?”

The committee is approved by assent.

### **Enrollment Management**

#### **Chair Professor Kulatilleke**

VP Mary Gorman (ex-officio, non-voting)

Armen Hovakimian - Economics and Finance - ZSB

Ross Goluboff - Mathematics - WSAS

Christopher Stults - Psychology - WSAS

Mary McGlynn - English - WSAS

Terry Martell - Chair - Faculty Senate

Marios Koufaris - Information Systems and Statistics - ZSB

Daniel Williams – Marx

The Committee participates in the formulation of policy related to graduate and undergraduate enrollment management, including qualifications and numbers of incoming students, the deployment of financial aid resources, and responses to Central Office enrollment management policies. The Committee reports to the Baruch College Faculty Senate plenary at least once a semester.

The committee is approved by assent.

### **Educational Policy**

#### **Chair Professor Axelrod**

Anne Swartz, Chair, Department of Fine and Performing Arts, Weissman School

Hector Cordero-Guzman, Marx School

Gayle DeLong, Economics and Finance, Zicklin School

Steven Melnick, Accountancy, Zicklin School

Clifford Wymbs, Marketing and International Business, Zicklin School

Linda Rath, Library

Christina Christoforatu, English, Weissman School

The committee's agenda will include consideration of college-wide educational policies, both of substance and procedure, relative to the pandemic environment.

The committee is approved by assent.

### **College Wide Curriculum**

#### **Chair Professor Bellamy**

Allison Lehr Samuels (Management)

Thomas Teufel (Phil)

Zoe Sheehan-Saldana (Fine&PerfArts)

Sanders Korenman (Marxe)

The College-wide Undergraduate Curriculum Committee reviews and approves college-wide curricular matters, including the undergraduate core curriculum and curricular mandates imposed by NYS, NYC, or CUNY that have a broad impact on College curricula. The Committee reports to the Baruch College Faculty Senate plenary at least once a semester.

The committee is approved by assent.

## **IV. Reports from College Officers**

### **a. President David Wu**

President Wu thanks the BFS Executive Committee for the interaction and engagement with the various college goals. The President remains open as to how to begin realizing these goals through various action plans. The President continues to have discussions with the Chancellor about the funding model at CUNY and in particular the allocation model for the senior colleges. This model has not changed in 20 years. With that being said the President reiterates the adjustment made to the base budget at the college. This adjustment is for 1.5 million dollars. Since Baruch has historically been mostly sustained through tuition revenue it was finally recognized that we were due some of this tuition revenue back. The end sum being that if we are able to retain some of the tuition in our budget we will already be in a much better situation. The President also noted that at recent meetings with the council of presidents and at board of trustees a 2023 budget has been submitted. This is the first time that CUNY has an identified budget

before SUNY. This may in part be because we have a new governor and a new mayor. Council members are being replaced and with it a new political climate has emerged which is more positive for CUNY. NY State is reporting a surplus for 2022-23 and this creates a more favorable climate for an increase of 11% in the overall budget. Coupled with the stimulus package from the federal government that remains in effect we are seeing a more positive resource environment.

*Question and Answer*

Professor Glenn Peterson asks about the general design of the new Plaza and the campus entry doors and whether or not these are replaceable should they break. The President will refer this question to VP Cobb for the November plenary.

b. Provost Linda Essig

Provost Essig noted that she comes to the Faculty Senate in the spirit of partnership and looks forward to working in partnership with each of the senate committees on matters of interest.

*Student vaccination policy.*

CUNY has informed students of the vaccination policy beginning May 10 and students have received frequent communication since then from both CUNY and Baruch. Our focus has been on providing a safe and healthy campus environment for the entire community, while maintaining students' academic standing and momentum. Students have received frequent communications across multiple modes. As a result, the number of Baruch students who may be adversely affected by the CUNY vaccination policy is relatively small—among the smallest in the system if not the smallest. As of today, we have approximately 39,000 in-person and hybrid registrations, that is “seats”, over 96% of which are filled by students who are fully vaccinated against Covid-19. [note that this does not mean that 96% of students are vaccinated, it means that 96% of in-person and hybrid seats are filled by vaccinated students.] These numbers change daily. But we don't want to have to withdraw a single student for noncompliance. Thus, the College has developed a set of implementation strategies that has been enacted since September 27th—the documentation upload deadline. Among these strategies includes a way for students who have found it “exceptionally challenging or impossible to get vaccinated” to do so in a timely fashion and remain in their hybrid and in-person classes. These students have been personally contacted by the EMSAI team and given an opportunity to discuss their path forward with the Office of the Dean of Students – Art King and his team and Mary Gorman and her team have been doing the work of communicating with the students both in groups and individually. Having been provided with the means to come into compliance and remain in class, the small number of affected students are now expected to do so by today - October 7. To exercise a culture of care, these cases are being assessed and addressed on an individual basis, student-by-student. Other tactics include a detailed assessment of every hybrid class section so that no student will be withdrawn from hybrid classes that have already held all in-person class meetings, as recorded in CUNY First. And, students who will not be meeting in-person until later in the semester (as recorded in CUNYFirst), will be able to upload their vaccination documentation up to ten days prior to the first on-campus meeting. Also, no students will be withdrawn from HyFlex courses (as recorded in CUNYFirst) for lack of compliance with the vaccination policy. In short, we aren't just withdrawing a big batch of students tomorrow morning October 8. We – and especially the office of the registrar – will look line by line at every student's record prior to assessing the WA grade. That assessment will take a couple of days, so we will start seeing those withdrawals at the earliest next week (week of 10/11).

*Spring 2022*



The CUNY policy, just released this week, is that students must be fully vaccinated when classes begin. Students will have until ten days prior to the first day of classes to upload their documentation. Students who have done so for Fall 2021 are already set.

*Research and innovation.*

The deadline for applications to the *Faculty Innovation Seed Grants* and the *Provost Innovation Fellows* is extended to October 15. The seed grant program is direct research support. Let me be clear – the seed grant program is to support interdisciplinary research that has the potential for securing additional external funding. When you hear me use the word “innovation” what I am talking about, after ed psych and creativity scholar Mihaly Csikszentmihalyi, is “a novel idea that has impact” – this can take two forms in the context of these grant programs: the creation of new knowledge through impactful research (the seed grant program) and the design or implementation of new ways of teaching that have impact (the fellows program). There is a third area, process innovation, and that can be seen in the work we do administratively, not just at the upper administration levels, but at all levels of the institution. One process innovation, not new to me but new to Baruch, is a comprehensive chairs calendar that was provided to department chairs last week. Please note that the Research Reopening plan has been revised to be less restrictive. To close out this topic....: The seed grant program is direct research support from the provost’s office.

*Travel waivers.*

While non-essential travel is still restricted by CUNY, we have had a pretty good record of having waivers approved by CUNY Central, sometimes with conditions, but overall, the approval rate is high. Please carefully review the policy: <https://www.cuny.edu/coronavirus/travel-guidance/>

Please do NOT send your travel waiver directly to me for signature. If the waiver is for grant-related travel, please route the request through Zolicia Abotsi in the SPAR office or if it is travel on state or BCF funding, please route the request through your school’s business office. The provost’s office is only accepting waivers that come from SPAR or a School Business office. That said, once received, turnaround in the provost’s office is 24-48 hours. Here are some tips for a successful application: a. Traveler should be vaccinated b. Include the Covid precautions being undertaken by the airline c. Include the Covid precautions being undertaken by the meeting venue – don’t just include a link, but copy and paste the protocols into the document – in other words, make it easy to say yes d. Include the Covid precautions being undertaken by the hotel - don’t just include a link, but copy and paste the protocols into the document – in other words, make it easy to say yes e. Finally, make a good case for the travel being essential – for example “I’m the panel organizer for the international session on Jurassic Studies and the entire event will be cancelled if I don’t attend” or “my grant from the NIH has a deliverables deadline of XXX that is critical to continuation of the grant” – essentially, make it hard for CUNY Central to say no – the Provost’s roll in this is to help you get them to yes.

*CAPS.*

You received news yesterday about the division of continuing and professional studies. There had been an examination of that structure that pre-dates my arrival along with more consultations with the staff. The change, while clearly necessary from a fiscal standpoint also enables us to reframe our strategy towards professional and continuing education and to further integrate those efforts with the academic schools.

*Search for the Dean of the Marx school*

We have engaged Russel Reynolds associates to assist us in this endeavor. The lead consultants, Jett Pihakis and Joi Hayes, will be meeting with various constituent groups October 21, 22. The search has begun!

*Question and answer*

Mr. Osvaldo Garcia from the Undergraduate Student Government asks whether or not those students subject to withdrawal from classes are aware of this fact? The Provost reiterates the lengths to which her office is going to contact these students and alert them to their obligations to demonstrate compliance with the vaccine mandate. Professor Zhou asks about the travel restrictions and also about the need for in-person meetings. The Provost asks that anyone wishing to travel that they apply for the travel waiver and to make a case for why the travel was essential. The CUNY Provosts that meet once a month were asked about the in-person meetings and currently there is no change.

**V.** Old Business

**VI.** New Business,

a. Additions to the Senate Roster:

i. Category I Senators

Professor Jun (Jonathan) Wang (Chair, EcoFin) nominated to represent the Zicklin School

Professor Gander nominated to represent the Weissman School

ii. Category III Senators

Professor Benedetto Fontana (PolSci) to replace Professor Michael Hankinson (PolSci)

**VII.** Adjournment at 2pm .

Respectfully submitted  
Richard Wilkins, PhD  
Faculty Senate Secretary